

Minutes of the Pre-bid meeting for Appointment of Consultant for “Preparation of Detailed Feasibility Report and providing Transaction Advisory Services for establishment of Fully Automated Material Recovery Facilities (MRF) in Madurai, Coimbatore, Tiruppur, Tambaram, Trichy, Tirunelveli and Erode Corporations” under SBM 2.0 held on 19.01.2023 at 11.00 AM in TNUIFSL office.

List of Participants:

Officials:

S. No	Name	Designation	Organisation
1	Mrs. Arokia Anbarasi	AE	O/o. DMA
2	Mr. Vinod. P. R	SWM Expert / SBM - PMU	O/o. DMA
3	Mr. U. Vijayaraghavan	Sr. Manager	TNUIFSL
4	Mrs. M. Shanthi	TQC	TNUIFSL

Consultants:

S. No	Name	Designation	Organisation
1	Mr. B. Hari Prakash	Sr. Manager	Reality Network
2	Mr. M. Vinothen	Project Manager	E& Y LLP
3	Dr. S. Saibabu	Managing Director	Pollucare
4	Mr. J. Rajaganapathy	Asst. Manager	Pollucare
5	Mr. P. Kamaraj	Sr. Engineer	Pollucare

S. No	Name	Designation	Organisation
6	Mr. D. Avinash Kumar	Environmental Expert	SSIA
7	Mr. Sandeep Singh	Operational Manager	SSIA
8	Mr. Preethi S Sharma		Samvad Partners
9	Mr. R. Pushkar		Samvad Partners
10	Mr. R. Praveenkumar	COO	Wasman Pro

At the outset, the objectives, scope of the assignment and outline of the tasks to be performed by the consultant was explained in detail. Written queries received from the consultants and other queries raised by the consultants were discussed during the meeting and the replies are also as follows:

S. No.	Clause no. / page no. of ToR	Details of referenced Clause	Amendment/Clarification Requested	Clarification given
1	Page No: 8 of 54	LETTER OF INVITATION 22. Joint Venture and Consortium / JV not allowed.	The option of participation of bidders by forming Joint Venture / Consortium has been declined as per the Clause mentioned. But, we feel that it is our duty to bring the following privilege of admitting JV / consortium in various identical 2 Sl. No Page No. Provision as per RFP Clarification / Suggestions tenders floated by Authority's across the country under Directorate of Municipal Administration programme promoted by Govt. of India. 1. Appointment of Project Management Consultant for Smart City Projects in Madurai City Municipal Corporation (The originally given Clause had been	Please refer addendum / corrigendum I to RFP issued.

S. No.	Clause no. / page no. of ToR	Details of referenced Clause	Amendment/Clarification Requested	Clarification given
			<p>amended and hence permitted JOINT VENTURE of bidding</p> <p>2. Selection of Project Management Consultant (PMC) to implement Area Based Development-Smart City Kochi.</p> <p>➤ ITC Clause Reference 11.1 of Data Sheet; Based on the grounds of establishing the above fact of admitting Joint Venture / Consortium under Smart City development projects, it is requested to consider issuing amendment for the inclusion of the facility of engaging Joint Venture / Consortium in the given RFP document.</p>	
2.	<p>Clause 7.2 (iv) Pg 4/57</p>	<p>(a) The Bidders who have successfully completed at least one feasibility/DPR study of Material Recovery Facilities (MRF) for Municipal Solid Waste of at least 100 MT in India and completed transaction advisory services in any Municipal Solid Waste Management assignment in India from 2016-17 to 2021-2022 wherein the project was developed as per the Solid Waste Management Rules 2016.</p> <p>Or</p> <p>(b) Bidders who have at least two ongoing feasibility/DPR study (at least 50% payment received, proof to be submitted) of Material Recovery Facilities (MRF) for Municipal Solid Waste of at least 100 MT (in which one assignment not less than 25 MT and totalling all assignment 100 MT) in India and completed transaction advisory services in any Municipal Solid Waste Management assignment in India, wherein the project was developed as per the Solid Waste Management Rules 2016.</p>	<p>Very few consulting assignments pertaining to Material Recovery Facilities (MRF) of 100 MT for MSW have been awarded in India and even lesser number of such assignments have been completed. Therefore, consulting assignments for bio mining should be considered as well since the same process of stabilising, trommelling, sieving and mechanical separation is adopted for legacy waste. Hence, we request you to consider the following technical qualification:</p> <p>(a) The Bidders who have successfully completed at least one feasibility/DPR study of Material Recovery Facilities (MRF) for Municipal Solid Waste of at least 100 MT or Biomining of Legacy Waste of 6 lakh cum (maximum of 2 projects) in India and completed transaction advisory services in any Municipal Solid Waste Management assignment in India from 2016-17 to 2021-2022 wherein the project was developed as per the Solid Waste Management Rules 2016.</p>	<p>Please refer addendum / corrigendum I to RFP issued.</p>

S. No.	Clause no. / page no. of ToR	Details of referenced Clause	Amendment/Clarification Requested	Clarification given
			Or (b) Bidders who have at least two ongoing feasibility/DPR study (at least 50% payment received, proof to be submitted) of Material Recovery Facilities (MRF) for Municipal Solid Waste of at least 100 MT (in which one assignment not less than 25 MT and totalling all assignment 100 MT) in India and completed transaction advisory services in any Municipal Solid Waste Management assignment in India, wherein the project was developed as per the Solid Waste Management Rules 2016.	
3	Clause 7.4.2 Pg 6/57	Proposals will finally be ranked according to their combined technical (St) and financial (Sf) scores using a weight of 75% for technical proposal and 25% for financial proposal.	Given the technical nature and overall complexity of the consulting assignments at hand, we request you to consider weightages for technical proposal & financial proposal as 80% and 20 % respectively	No change. RFP conditions are confirmed.
4	Clause 22 Pg 8/57	Joint Venture and Consortium / JV not allowed.	We request you to consider Joint Venture / Consortium of a maximum of 2 bidders to be allowed in order to enable the optimal mix of best-in-class consultants for the successful implementation proposed assignment.	Please refer addendum / corrigendum I to RFP issued.
5	General	Scope of Work	The Scope of Work doesn't account for handholding period (of Authority & Contractor/ Concessionaire) after signing of the Agreement by Authority & Contractor/ Concessionaire. This is a very critical aspect for successful implementation of the project and hence we request that a minimum of 4 weeks of handholding services from the date of agreement signing should be included in the scope of work as well.	No change. RFP conditions are confirmed.
6	Annexure 1, Clause 18 Pg 20/57	Team Composition & Qualification Requirements for the Key Experts	We request you to consider modifications in qualification & experience of the experts.	No change. RFP conditions are confirmed.

S. No.	Clause no. / page no. of ToR	Details of referenced Clause	Amendment/Clarification Requested	Clarification given																																																
7	Annexure 1, Clause 18 Pg 20/57	The Team Leader / Project Development Expert shall be full time professional for all the activities i.e., DFR, TA services& Handholding period and to be stationed in concerned corporation till the completion of Study.	Given that there is only one Team Leader and 7 ULBS, this is not possible. From our understanding, the entire team can be stationed in Chennai (since client is DMA whose Head Office is in Chennai) with visits to the concerned ULBS as per client and/ or project requirement. Additionally, one Project Coordinator can be appointed for each ULB who shall be stationed at the respective ULBS. Please clarify.	Please refer addendum / corrigendum I to RFP issued.																																																
8	Annexure 1, Clause 9, page 18/57	<p>Timeline:</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th rowspan="2">S. No</th> <th rowspan="2">Deliverables</th> <th colspan="3">Cumulative weeks from Date of Award</th> </tr> <tr> <th>Trichy & Tambaram *</th> <th>Madurai & Tirunelveli *</th> <th>Coimbatore, Erode & Tiruppur *</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>1</td> <td>Draft Detailed Feasibility Report</td> <td>4 weeks</td> <td>5 weeks</td> <td>6 weeks</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2</td> <td>Final Detailed Feasibility Report with draft Bid Documents</td> <td>6 weeks</td> <td>8 weeks</td> <td>10 weeks</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3</td> <td>Final Bid Documents</td> <td>8 weeks</td> <td>10 weeks</td> <td>12 weeks</td> </tr> <tr> <td>4</td> <td>Publication of REOI / RFQ / RTP / RFP</td> <td>9 weeks</td> <td>12 weeks</td> <td>14 weeks</td> </tr> <tr> <td>5</td> <td>Completion of pre-bid meeting and issue of additional clarifications and response to bidder queries</td> <td>12 weeks</td> <td>14 weeks</td> <td>16 weeks</td> </tr> <tr> <td>6</td> <td>Approval of bid evaluation report for REOI / RFQ / RTP / RFP</td> <td>14 weeks</td> <td>16 weeks</td> <td>18 weeks</td> </tr> <tr> <td>7</td> <td>Signing of agreement by implementing authority with successful bidder</td> <td>16 weeks</td> <td>18 weeks</td> <td>20 weeks</td> </tr> <tr> <td></td> <td>Total</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p><i>* Prorata payment will be paid (as per negotiated financial proposal) for each of the ULB / location on submission and approval of stage wise reports.</i></p>	S. No	Deliverables	Cumulative weeks from Date of Award			Trichy & Tambaram *	Madurai & Tirunelveli *	Coimbatore, Erode & Tiruppur *	1	Draft Detailed Feasibility Report	4 weeks	5 weeks	6 weeks	2	Final Detailed Feasibility Report with draft Bid Documents	6 weeks	8 weeks	10 weeks	3	Final Bid Documents	8 weeks	10 weeks	12 weeks	4	Publication of REOI / RFQ / RTP / RFP	9 weeks	12 weeks	14 weeks	5	Completion of pre-bid meeting and issue of additional clarifications and response to bidder queries	12 weeks	14 weeks	16 weeks	6	Approval of bid evaluation report for REOI / RFQ / RTP / RFP	14 weeks	16 weeks	18 weeks	7	Signing of agreement by implementing authority with successful bidder	16 weeks	18 weeks	20 weeks		Total				With the amount of survey works to be done for the project, the proposed timelines for submission of Draft Detailed Feasibility Report seems very less. The consultant needs to do the waste quantification survey, environmental monitoring, social survey, geo technical investigation etc at seven different locations. All the survey concept needs to be finalized with TNUIFSL, DMA after which the surveys will commence. This process will definitely take time. Hence, we request you revise the timelines for submission of Draft Detailed feasibility Report by a minimum of 8 weeks, 9 weeks and 10 weeks respectively.	No change. RFP conditions are confirmed. Survey should be done parallelly in all ULBs by engaging different teams. The survey of locations etc shall be discussed and finalised with concerned ULBs officials.
S. No	Deliverables	Cumulative weeks from Date of Award																																																		
		Trichy & Tambaram *	Madurai & Tirunelveli *	Coimbatore, Erode & Tiruppur *																																																
1	Draft Detailed Feasibility Report	4 weeks	5 weeks	6 weeks																																																
2	Final Detailed Feasibility Report with draft Bid Documents	6 weeks	8 weeks	10 weeks																																																
3	Final Bid Documents	8 weeks	10 weeks	12 weeks																																																
4	Publication of REOI / RFQ / RTP / RFP	9 weeks	12 weeks	14 weeks																																																
5	Completion of pre-bid meeting and issue of additional clarifications and response to bidder queries	12 weeks	14 weeks	16 weeks																																																
6	Approval of bid evaluation report for REOI / RFQ / RTP / RFP	14 weeks	16 weeks	18 weeks																																																
7	Signing of agreement by implementing authority with successful bidder	16 weeks	18 weeks	20 weeks																																																
	Total																																																			
9	Letter of invitation Clause 6.4, Page 3/57	The sealed envelopes Cover 1, Cover 2 and Cover3 should again be placed in a separate sealed in one cover, which shall be clearly marked with the name of the assignment and received in the office of the Tamil Nadu Urban Infrastructure Financial Services Limited (TNUIFSL), No. 19, T.P. Scheme Road, Raja	Requesting to provide extension of time for Submission of Proposals by minimum of two weeks.	Please refer addendum / corrigendum I to RFP issued.																																																

S. No.	Clause no. / page no. of ToR	Details of referenced Clause	Amendment/Clarification Requested	Clarification given
		Annamalaipuram, Chennai – 600 028, up to 11.00 hours on 30.01.2023.		
10	Page no.4 clause 7.2 (iv)	<p>Pre-Qualification criteria:</p> <p>(a) The Bidders who have successfully completed at least one feasibility/DPR study of Material Recovery Facilities (MRF) for Municipal Solid Waste of at least 100 MT in India and completed transaction advisory services in any Municipal Solid Waste Management assignment in India from 2016-17 to 2021-2022 wherein the project was developed as per the Solid Waste Management Rules 2016.</p> <p>Or</p> <p>(b) Bidders who have at least two ongoing feasibility/DPR study (at least 50% payment received, proof to be submitted) of Material Recovery Facilities (MRF) for Municipal Solid Waste of at least 100 MT (in which one assignment not less than 25 MT and totaling all assignment 100 MT) in India and completed transaction advisory services in any Municipal Solid Waste Management assignment in India, wherein the project was developed as per the Solid Waste Management Rules 2016.</p>	<p>(a) The Bidders who have successfully completed at least one feasibility/DPR study of Material Recovery Facilities (MRF) for Municipal Solid Waste of at least 100 MT in India and completed transaction advisory services in any Municipal Solid Waste Management assignment in India from 2016-17 to 2021-2022 wherein the project was developed as per the Solid Waste Management Rules 2016.</p> <p>Or</p> <p>(b) Bidders who have at least one ongoing detailed feasibility/DPR study and providing Transaction Advisory services for Municipal Solid Waste of at least 100 MT in India, wherein the project was developed as per the Solid Waste Management Rules 2016.</p>	Please refer addendum / corrigendum I to RFP issued.
11	Page no.8 clause 9.22.	Joint Venture and Consortium / JV not allowed.	The bidder shall be a single entity or Joint Venture/Consortium will be permitted for providing services under this bid. Experience of JV or consortium partner is also allowed.	Please refer addendum / corrigendum I to RFP issued.
12	Page no. 6 Clause 7.4.2	Proposals will finally be ranked according to their combined technical (St) and financial (Sf) scores using a weight of 75% for technical proposal and 25% for financial proposal. Given the technical nature and overall complexity of the consulting assignments at hand.	we request you to consider weightages for technical proposal & financial proposal as 80% and 20 % respectively	No change. RFP conditions are confirmed.

S. No.	Clause no. / page no. of ToR	Details of referenced Clause	Amendment/Clarification Requested	Clarification given
13	Page no.8 clause 9.22.	as per clause no 22 of the RFP, Joint Ventures and Consortium are not allowed	Considering the scope of the project, we are of the opinion that transaction advisors in consortium with technical consultants will be able to deliver the services in a better way. Also, in order to encourage competition among the prospective bidders, we request you to allow the consortium in the said tender.	Please refer addendum / corrigendum I to RFP issued.

Sd/-
Mission Director, SBM, Urban 2, (SBM 2.0),
Tamil Nadu /
Director of Municipal Administration