

Minutes of the Pre-bid meeting for Appointment of Consultant for “Preparation of Detailed Feasibility Report and providing Transaction Advisory Services for establishment of Bio-CNG plant in Madurai, Coimbatore, Salem, Tiruchirappalli, Tirunelveli, Tiruppur, Thanjavur, Nagercoil and Tambaram Corporations” under SBM 2.0 held on 19.01.2023 at 11.30 AM in TNUIFSL office.

List of Participants:

Officials:

S. No	Name	Designation	Organisation
1	Mrs. Arokia Anbarasi	AE	O/o. DMA
2	Mr. Vinod. P. R	SWM Expert / SBM - PMU	O/o. DMA
3	Mr. U. Vijayaraghavan	Sr. Manager	TNUIFSL
4	Mrs. M. Shanthi	TQC	TNUIFSL

Consultants:

S. No	Name	Designation	Organisation
1	Mr. B. Hari Prakash	Sr. Manager	Reality Network
2	Mr. M. Vinothen	Project Manager	E& Y LLP
3	Dr. S. Saibabu	Managing Director	Pollucare
4	Mr. J. Rajaganapathy	Asst. Manager	Pollucare
5	Mr. P. Kamaraj	Sr. Engineer	Pollucare
6	Mr. D. Avinash Kumar	Environmental Expert	SSIA

S. No	Name	Designation	Organisation
7	Mr. Sandeep Singh	Operational Manager	SSIA
8	Mr. Preethi S Sharma		Samvad Partners
9	Mr. R. Pushkar		Samvad Partners
10	Mr. R. Praveenkumar	COO	Wasman Pro

At the outset, the objectives, scope of the assignment and outline of the tasks to be performed by the consultant was explained in detail. Written queries received from the consultants and other queries raised by the consultants were discussed during the meeting and the replies are also as follows:

S.No.	Clause no. / page no. of ToR	Details of referenced Clause	Amendment/Clarification Requested	Clarification given
1.	Page No: 8 of 54	LETTER OF INVITATION 22. Joint Venture and Consortium / JV not allowed.	<p>The option of participation of bidders by forming Joint Venture / Consortium has been declined as per the Clause mentioned. But, we feel that it is our duty to bring the following privilege of admitting JV / consortium in various identical 2 Sl. No Page No. Provision as per RFP Clarification / Suggestions tenders floated by Authority's across the country under Directorate of Municipal Administration programme promoted by Govt. of India.</p> <p>1. Appointment of Project Management Consultant for Smart City Projects in Madurai City Municipal Corporation (The originally given Clause had been amended and hence permitted JOINT VENTURE of bidding</p>	Please refer addendum / corrigendum I to RFP issued.

S.No.	Clause no. / page no. of ToR	Details of referenced Clause	Amendment/Clarification Requested	Clarification given
			2. Selection of Project Management Consultant (PMC) to implement Area Based Development-Smart City Kochi. ➤ ITC Clause Reference 11.1 of Data Sheet; Based on the grounds of establishing the above fact of admitting Joint Venture / Consortium under Smart City development projects, it is requested to consider issuing amendment for the inclusion of the facility of engaging Joint Venture / Consortium in the given RFP document.	
2.	6. The Submission of Proposals: /Page. no 3	6.2 The first envelope marked "Pre-qualification criteria" in one separate cover, viz., Cover-1 must be sealed with sealing wax and initialled twice across the seal. This cover should contain the Earnest Money Deposit (EMD) of Rs. 95,000/- in the form of Demand Draft to be taken in the name of "Mission Director SBM2.0, Tamil Nadu, / Directorate of Municipal Administration" Chennai – 600 028. The EMD of unsuccessful firms will be returned within 45 days of the date of completion of selection / tender process.	Kindly request to accept the EMD in the form of bank guarantee. We request to provide the bank guarantee format along with mandatory bank details to execute the said bank guarantee. Please accept the request	No change. RFP conditions are confirmed.
	6. The Submission of Proposals: /Page. no 3	6.4 The sealed envelopes Cover 1, Cover 2 and Cover3 should again be placed in a separate sealed in one cover, which shall be clearly marked with the name of the assignment and received in the office of the Tamil Nadu Urban Infrastructure Financial Services Limited (TNUIFSL), No. 19, T.P. Scheme Road, Raja Annamalaipuram, Chennai – 600 028, up to 11.00 hours on 30.01.2023	Kindly request to extend the last date for bid submission by 15 more days from current due date. (Please considering the bid preparation & courier delivery time)	Please refer addendum / corrigendum I to RFP issued.
3	7.2 Prequalifica	(iv) (a) The Bidders who have successfully completed at least one feasibility/DPR study of Bio CNG plant for Municipal Solid Waste of at least 100 MT in India and	1. Kindly specify the unit of 100 MT. Does it mean 100 MT per day or any other unit? Please clarify.	100 MT means 100 Tonnes per day.

S.No.	Clause no. / page no. of ToR	Details of referenced Clause	Amendment/Clarification Requested	Clarification given
	tion /Page. no 4	completed transaction advisory services in any Municipal Solid Waste Management assignment in India from 2016-17 to 2021-2022 wherein the project was developed as per the Solid Waste Management Rules 2016. Or (b) Bidders who have at least two ongoing feasibility/DPR study (at least 50% payment received, proof to be submitted) of Bio CNG plant for Municipal Solid Waste of at least 100 MT (in which one assignment not less than 25 MT and totaling all assignment 100 MT) in India and completed transaction advisory services in any Municipal Solid Waste Management assignment in India, wherein the project was developed as per the Solid Waste Management Rules 2016	2. We have experience of feasibility/DPR study of Bio CNG plant for Napier grass, press mud & any other biomass. Kindly consider the other feedstock other than MSW. 3. We have completed draft DPR & submitted to client. Is the said experience will be considered for further evaluation?	Please also refer addendum / corrigendum I to RFP issued.
4	Annexure – 2 - B POWER OF ATTORNEY /Page. no 35	Annexure – 2 - B POWER OF ATTORNEY	We have general power of attorney with board resolution for submitting the various bids on behalf of company. Should we submit the notary attested copy of general power of attorney along with board resolution? Please confirm & accept the same	Kindly submit the documents as per RFP conditions
5	Annexure – 2 - D Financial Qualification of Bidder/Page . no 38	CA certification	We have a CA certified annual turnover certificate with UDIN no for latest 5 years, showing the value of Annual Turnover, Net worth & profit & loss in the certificate. Should we submit the notary attested copy of CA certified annual turnover certificate	Annexure 2-D shall be duly filled and signed by Chartered Accountants as per the format. Bidders has to submit relevant financial details / reports as per the RFP requirements.
6	General Clause and vis-versa.	Parent Organization Capability	Please allow the Parent organization to use the capabilities (Technical and Financial) of the wholly own subsidiary and vis-versa.	No change. RFP conditions are confirmed.

S.No.	Clause no. / page no. of ToR	Details of referenced Clause	Amendment/Clarification Requested	Clarification given
7	Letter Of Invitation Point 6.2 Page 3 Of Rfp	Earnest Money Deposit (EMD)	Please consider exemption of EMD for the firms registered with SSI and having MSME certification. If not exempted, kindly allow the BG as submission of EMD. "As per Rule 170 of GFR--- "Micro and Small Enterprises (MSEs) as defined in MSE Procurement Policy issued by Department of Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises (MSME) along with NSIC certificate" are exempt from submission of EMD (Bid security). Bidders claiming exemption of EMD under this rule (170 of GFR) are however required to submit a signed Bid securing declaration."	Please refer addendum / corrigendum I to RFP issued.
8	Pre-qualification Point 7.2 Page 4 Of Rfp	(iv) (a) The Bidders who have successfully completed at least one feasibility/DPR study of Bio CNG plant for Municipal Solid Waste of at least 100 MT in India and completed transaction advisory services in any Municipal Solid Waste Management assignment in India from 2016-17to 2021-2022 wherein the project was developed as per the Solid Waste Management Rules 2016. Or (b) Bidders who have at least two ongoing feasibility/DPR study (at least 50% payment received, proof to be submitted) of Bio CNG plant for Municipal Solid Waste of at least 100 MT (in which one assignment not less than 25 MT and totaling all assignment 100 MT) in India and completed transaction advisory services in any Municipal Solid Waste Management assignment in India, wherein the	We request you to kindly modify the clause as mentioned below: (iv) (a) The Bidders / Joint Venture who have successfully completed at least one feasibility/DPR study of Bio CNG plant for Municipal Solid Waste of at least 100 MT in India and completed transaction advisory services in any Municipal Solid Waste Management assignment in India from 2016-17 to 2021-2022 wherein the project was developed as per the Solid Waste Management Rules 2016. Or (b) Bidders who have at least two ongoing feasibility/DPR study (at least 50% payment received, proof to be submitted) of Bio CNG plant for Municipal Solid Waste of at least 100 MT (in which one assignment not less than 25 MT and totalling all assignment 100 MT) in India and completed transaction advisory services in any Municipal Solid Waste Management assignment in India, wherein the project was developed as per the Solid Waste Management Rules 2016.	Please refer addendum / corrigendum I to RFP issued.

S.No.	Clause no. / page no. of ToR	Details of referenced Clause	Amendment/Clarification Requested	Clarification given
		project was developed as per the Solid Waste Management Rules 2016.		
9	Letter Of Invitation Point 22 Page 8 Of Rfp	Joint Venture and Consortium / JV not allowed.	We request you to kindly allow Joint Venture and Consortium / JV to participate in selection process and Bidder should meet Technical and financial criteria jointly.	Please refer addendum / corrigendum I to RFP issued.
10	Letter Of Invitation Point 6.2 Page 3 Of Rfp	Deadline of submission 30.01.2023.	We request you to kindly extend the date of submission for at least 15 days after receiving the clarifications of above queries.	Please refer addendum / corrigendum I to RFP issued.
11	Page no.4 clause 7.2 (iv)	Pre-Qualification criteria: (a) The Bidders who have successfully completed at least one feasibility/DPR study of Material Recovery Facilities (MRF) for Municipal Solid Waste of at least 100 MT in India and completed transaction advisory services in any Municipal Solid Waste Management assignment in India from 2016-17 to 2021-2022 wherein the project was developed as per the Solid Waste Management Rules 2016. Or (b) Bidders who have at least two ongoing feasibility/DPR study (at least 50% payment received, proof to be submitted) of Material Recovery Facilities (MRF) for Municipal Solid Waste of at least 100 MT (in which one assignment not less than 25 MT and totaling all assignment 100 MT) in India and completed transaction advisory services in any	(a) The Bidders who have successfully completed at least one feasibility/DPR study of Material Recovery Facilities (MRF) for Municipal Solid Waste of at least 100 MT in India and completed transaction advisory services in any Municipal Solid Waste Management assignment in India from 2016-17 to 2021-2022 wherein the project was developed as per the Solid Waste Management Rules 2016. Or (b) Bidders who have at least one ongoing detailed feasibility/DPR study and providing Transaction Advisory services for Municipal Solid Waste of at least 100 MT in India, wherein the project was developed as per the Solid Waste Management Rules 2016.	Please refer addendum / corrigendum I to RFP issued.

S.No.	Clause no. / page no. of ToR	Details of referenced Clause	Amendment/Clarification Requested	Clarification given
		Municipal Solid Waste Management assignment in India, wherein the project was developed as per the Solid Waste Management Rules 2016.		
12	Page no.8 clause 9.22.	Joint Venture and Consortium / JV not allowed.	The bidder shall be a single entity or Joint Venture/Consortium will be permitted for providing services under this bid. Experience of JV or consortium partner is also allowed.	Please refer addendum / corrigendum I to RFP issued.
13	Page no. 6 Clause 7.4.2	Proposals will finally be ranked according to their combined technical (St) and financial (Sf) scores using a weight of 75% for technical proposal and 25% for financial proposal. Given the technical nature and overall complexity of the consulting assignments at hand	we request you to consider weightages for technical proposal & financial proposal as 80% and 20 % respectively	No change. RFP conditions are confirmed.
14	Page no. 3 Clause 6.4	Last Date for submission of proposal is 11.00 hours on 30.01.2023	We request you to Extend further two weeks for submission of proposal i.e 11 hours on 15.02.2023	Please refer addendum / corrigendum I to RFP issued.
15	Clause 7.2 (iv) Pg 4/57	(a) The Bidders who have successfully completed at least one feasibility/DPR study of Bio CNG plant for Municipal Solid Waste of at least 100 MT in India and completed transaction advisory services in any Municipal Solid Waste Management assignment in India from 2016-17 to 2021-2022 wherein the project was developed as per the Solid Waste Management Rules 2016. Or (b) Bidders who have at least two ongoing feasibility/DPR study (at least 50% payment received, proof to be submitted) of Bio CNG plant for Municipal Solid Waste of at least 100 MT (in which one assignment not less than 25 MT and totalling all	Very few consulting assignments pertaining to BIO CNG of 100 MT for MSW have been awarded in India and even lesser number of such assignments have been completed. Therefore, consulting assignments for solid waste to fuel should be considered as well. Hence, we request you to consider the following technical qualification: (a) The Bidders who have successfully completed at least one feasibility/DPR study of Bio CNG plant for Municipal Solid Waste of at least 100 MT in India and completed transaction advisory services in any Municipal Solid Waste Management assignment in India from 2016-17 to 2021-2022 wherein the project was developed as per the Solid Waste Management Rules 2016. Or	Please refer addendum / corrigendum I to RFP issued.

S.No.	Clause no. / page no. of ToR	Details of referenced Clause	Amendment/Clarification Requested	Clarification given
		assignment 100 MT) in India and completed transaction advisory services in any Municipal Solid Waste Management assignment in India, wherein the project was developed as per the Solid Waste Management Rules 2016.	(b) Bidders who have at least two ongoing feasibility/DPR study (at least 50% payment received, proof to be submitted) of Bio CNG plant for Municipal Solid Waste of at least 100 MT (in which one assignment not less than 25 MT and totalling all assignment 100 MT) in India and completed transaction advisory services in any Municipal Solid Waste Management assignment in India, wherein the project was developed as per the Solid Waste Management Rules 2016. Or (c) Bidders who have successfully completed Transaction Advisory Services for Solid Waste to Fuel of at least 100 MT in India and successfully completed DFR/ DPR preparation services (DFR/DPR cost has been approved by the government) in any Municipal Solid Waste Management assignment in India from 2016-17 to 2021-2022 wherein the project was developed as per the Solid Waste Management Rules 2016	
16	Clause 7.4.2 Pg 6/57	Proposals will finally be ranked according to their combined technical (St) and financial (Sf) scores using a weight of 75% for technical proposal and 25% for financial proposal.	Given the technical nature and overall complexity of the consulting assignments at hand, we request you to consider weightages for technical proposal & financial proposal as 80% and 20 % respectively	No change. RFP conditions are confirmed.
17	Clause 22 Pg 8/57	Joint Venture and Consortium / JV not allowed.	We request you to consider Joint Venture / Consortium of a maximum of 2 bidders to be allowed in order to enable the optimal mix of best-in-class consultants for the successful implementation proposed assignment.	Please refer addendum / corrigendum I to RFP issued.
18	General	Scope of Work	The Scope of Work doesn't account for handholding period (of Authority & Contractor/ Concessionaire) after signing of the Agreement by Authority & Contractor/ Concessionaire.	No change. RFP conditions are confirmed.

S.No.	Clause no. / page no. of ToR	Details of referenced Clause	Amendment/Clarification Requested	Clarification given
			This is a very critical aspect for successful implementation of the project and hence we request that a minimum of 4 weeks of handholding services from the date of agreement signing should be included in the scope of work as well.	
19	Annexure 1, Clause 18 Pg 20/57	Team Composition & Qualification Requirements for the Key Experts	We request you to consider the experts qualifications provided in annexure I	No change. RFP conditions are confirmed.
20	Annexure 1, Clause 18 Pg 20/57	The Team Leader / Project Development Expert shall be full time professional for all the activities i.e., DFR, TA services& Handholding period and to be stationed in concerned corporation till the completion of Study.	Given that there is only one Team Leader and 9 ULBS, this is not possible. From our understanding, the entire team can be stationed in Chennai (since client is DMA whose Head Office is in Chennai) with visits to the concerned ULBS as per client and/ or project requirement. Additionally, one Project Coordinator can be appointed for each ULB who shall be stationed at the respective ULBS. Please clarify.	Please refer addendum / corrigendum I to RFP issued.

S.No.	Clause no. / page no. of ToR	Details of referenced Clause	Amendment/Clarification Requested	Clarification given																																																
21	Annexure 1, Clause 4, page 18/57	<p>Timeline:</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th rowspan="2">S. No</th> <th rowspan="2">Deliverables</th> <th colspan="3">Cumulative weeks from Date of Award</th> </tr> <tr> <th>Trichy, Thanjavur & Tambaram *</th> <th>Coimbatore, Salem & Tiruppur *</th> <th>Madurai, Tirunelveli & Nagercoil *</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>1</td> <td>Draft Detailed Feasibility Report</td> <td>4 weeks</td> <td>5 weeks</td> <td>6 weeks</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2</td> <td>Final Detailed Feasibility Report with draft Bid Documents</td> <td>6 weeks</td> <td>8 weeks</td> <td>10 weeks</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3</td> <td>Final Bid Documents</td> <td>8 weeks</td> <td>10 weeks</td> <td>12 weeks</td> </tr> <tr> <td>4</td> <td>Publication of REOI / RFQ / RTP / RFP</td> <td>9 weeks</td> <td>12 weeks</td> <td>14 weeks</td> </tr> <tr> <td>5</td> <td>Completion of pre-bid meeting and issue of additional clarifications and response to bidder queries</td> <td>12 weeks</td> <td>14 weeks</td> <td>16 weeks</td> </tr> <tr> <td>6</td> <td>Approval of bid evaluation report for REOI / RFQ / RTP / RFP</td> <td>14 weeks</td> <td>16 weeks</td> <td>18 weeks</td> </tr> <tr> <td>7</td> <td>Signing of agreement by implementing authority with successful bidder</td> <td>16 weeks</td> <td>18 weeks</td> <td>20 weeks</td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="2" style="text-align: center;">Total</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p><i>* Prorata payment will be paid (as per negotiated financial proposal) for each of the ULB / location on submission and approval of stage wise reports.</i></p>	S. No	Deliverables	Cumulative weeks from Date of Award			Trichy, Thanjavur & Tambaram *	Coimbatore, Salem & Tiruppur *	Madurai, Tirunelveli & Nagercoil *	1	Draft Detailed Feasibility Report	4 weeks	5 weeks	6 weeks	2	Final Detailed Feasibility Report with draft Bid Documents	6 weeks	8 weeks	10 weeks	3	Final Bid Documents	8 weeks	10 weeks	12 weeks	4	Publication of REOI / RFQ / RTP / RFP	9 weeks	12 weeks	14 weeks	5	Completion of pre-bid meeting and issue of additional clarifications and response to bidder queries	12 weeks	14 weeks	16 weeks	6	Approval of bid evaluation report for REOI / RFQ / RTP / RFP	14 weeks	16 weeks	18 weeks	7	Signing of agreement by implementing authority with successful bidder	16 weeks	18 weeks	20 weeks	Total					<p>With the amount of survey works to be done for the project, the proposed time lines for submission of Draft Detailed Feasibility Report seems very less. The consultant needs to do the waste quantification survey, environmental monitoring, social survey, geo technical investigation etc at nine different locations. All the survey concept needs to be finalized with TNUIFSL, DMA after which the surveys will commence. This process will definitely take time. Hence, We request you revise the timelines for submission of Draft Detailed feasibility Report by a minimum of 8 weeks, 9 weeks and 10 weeks respectively.</p>	<p>No change. RFP conditions are confirmed.</p> <p>Survey should be done parallelly in all ULBs by engaging different teams. The survey locations, etc shall be discussed and finalised with concerned ULBs officials.</p>
S. No	Deliverables	Cumulative weeks from Date of Award																																																		
		Trichy, Thanjavur & Tambaram *	Coimbatore, Salem & Tiruppur *	Madurai, Tirunelveli & Nagercoil *																																																
1	Draft Detailed Feasibility Report	4 weeks	5 weeks	6 weeks																																																
2	Final Detailed Feasibility Report with draft Bid Documents	6 weeks	8 weeks	10 weeks																																																
3	Final Bid Documents	8 weeks	10 weeks	12 weeks																																																
4	Publication of REOI / RFQ / RTP / RFP	9 weeks	12 weeks	14 weeks																																																
5	Completion of pre-bid meeting and issue of additional clarifications and response to bidder queries	12 weeks	14 weeks	16 weeks																																																
6	Approval of bid evaluation report for REOI / RFQ / RTP / RFP	14 weeks	16 weeks	18 weeks																																																
7	Signing of agreement by implementing authority with successful bidder	16 weeks	18 weeks	20 weeks																																																
Total																																																				
22	Annexue-1: page 31/57	9. Tiruppur City Municipal Corporation	Requesting to provide the relevant data related to Tiruppur Corporation ISWM facilities data.	Please refer addendum / corrigendum I to RFP issued.																																																
23	Letter of invitation Clause 6.4, Page 3/57	The sealed envelopes Cover 1, Cover 2 and Cover3 should again be placed in a separate sealed in one cover, which shall be clearly marked with the name of the assignment and received in the office of the Tamil Nadu Urban Infrastructure Financial Services Limited (TNUIFSL), No. 19, T.P. Scheme Road, Raja Annamalaipuram, Chennai – 600 028, up to 11.00 hours on 30.01.2023.	Requesting to provide extension of time for Submission of Proposals by minimum of two weeks. .	Please refer addendum / corrigendum I to RFP issued.																																																

S.No.	Clause no. / page no. of ToR	Details of referenced Clause	Amendment/Clarification Requested	Clarification given
24	Page no.8 clause 9.22.	as per clause no 22 of the RFP, Joint Ventures and Consortium are not allowed	Considering the scope of the project, we are of the opinion that transaction advisors in consortium with technical consultants will be able to deliver the services in a better way. Also, in order to encourage competition among the prospective bidders, we request you to allow the consortium in the said tender.	Please refer addendum / corrigendum I to RFP issued.

Sd/-
Mission Director, SBM, Urban 2, (SBM 2.0),
Tamil Nadu /
Director of Municipal Administration